

Exhibit B

EX. B to Abel
(Alphabetically by Last Name of 9/11 Decedent)

	DECEDENT First Name	DECEDENT Middle Name	DECEDENT Last Name	Suffix Name	Economic Damage Amount	Non-Economic Damage Amount	TOTAL Damage Amount
1.	Laurence	C.	Abel		\$709,220	\$2,000,000	\$2,709,220
2.	Gary		Albero		\$8,724,313	\$2,000,000	\$10,724,313
3.	Louis	F.	Aversano	Jr.	\$1,819,891	\$2,000,000	\$3,819,891
4.	Samuel		Ayala		\$1,536,006	\$2,000,000	\$3,536,006
5.	Eric	L.	Bennett		\$5,105,420	\$2,000,000	\$7,105,420
6.	Frank	J.	Bonomo		\$3,241,147	\$2,000,000	\$5,241,147
7.	Gary	L.	Bright			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
8.	Alejandro		Castano		\$1,306,714	\$2,000,000	\$3,306,714
9.	Ana	M.	Centeno		\$2,817,552	\$2,000,000	\$4,817,552
10.	Mohammed	S.	Chowdhury		\$2,946,322	\$2,000,000	\$4,946,322
11.	Edna		Cintron		\$1,174,415	\$2,000,000	\$3,174,415
12.	Kevin	F.	Cleary		\$3,315,667	\$2,000,000	\$5,315,667
13.	Michael		Curtin		\$2,966,495	\$2,000,000	\$4,966,495
14.	Matthew		Diaz			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
15.	Patricia	F.	DiChiaro			\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
TOTALS					\$35,663,162	\$30,000,000	\$65,663,162

Exhibit B-1

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mr. Eric Bennett**

December 28, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **August 16, 2002**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	4.2%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Mr. Eric Bennett

	<u>Present Value</u>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$4,862,248
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	243,172
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
Total	<u><u>\$5,105,420</u></u>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
210,036	3.0%	29.050%	2,359	48.039%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Mr. Eric Bennett
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	30	0.31	1.00000	\$67,110	\$736	\$0	(\$19,495)	(\$22,874)	\$25,477	\$25,477
2002	31	1.31	1.07201	225,162	2,529	(4,846)	(63,447)	(74,442)	84,955	84,955
2003	32	2.31	1.06997	240,917	2,706	(5,186)	(67,887)	(79,651)	90,900	90,900
2004	33	3.31	1.06794	257,284	2,890	(5,538)	(72,499)	(85,062)	97,076	97,076
2005	34	4.31	1.06591	274,241	3,080	(5,903)	(77,277)	(90,668)	103,473	103,473
2006	35	5.31	1.06388	291,758	3,277	(6,280)	(82,213)	(96,459)	110,083	110,083
2007	36	6.31	1.06185	309,804	3,480	(6,668)	(87,298)	(102,426)	116,892	116,892
2008	37	7.31	1.05983	328,340	3,688	(7,067)	(92,521)	(108,554)	123,886	123,886
2009	38	8.31	1.05781	347,323	3,901	(7,476)	(97,870)	(114,830)	131,048	131,048
2010	39	9.31	1.05580	366,704	4,119	(7,893)	(103,332)	(121,238)	138,361	138,361
2011	40	10.31	1.05379	386,430	4,340	(8,318)	(108,890)	(127,759)	145,804	145,804
2012	41	11.31	1.05179	406,442	4,565	(8,748)	(114,529)	(134,376)	153,354	153,354
2013	42	12.31	1.04979	426,677	4,793	(9,184)	(120,231)	(141,066)	160,989	160,989
2014	43	13.31	1.04779	447,067	5,022	(9,623)	(125,977)	(147,807)	168,682	168,682
2015	44	14.31	1.04579	467,541	5,251	(10,063)	(131,746)	(154,576)	176,407	176,407
2016	45	15.31	1.04380	488,021	5,482	(10,504)	(137,517)	(161,347)	184,135	184,135
2017	46	16.31	1.04182	508,429	5,711	(10,943)	(143,268)	(168,094)	191,835	191,835
2018	47	17.31	1.03984	528,682	5,938	(11,379)	(148,975)	(174,790)	199,476	199,476
2019	48	18.31	1.03786	548,696	6,163	(11,810)	(154,614)	(181,407)	207,028	207,028
2020	49	19.31	1.03588	568,384	6,384	(12,234)	(160,162)	(187,916)	214,456	209,745
2021	50	20.31	1.03391	587,658	6,601	(12,649)	(165,593)	(194,288)	221,729	208,116
2022	51	21.31	1.03194	606,430	6,812	(13,053)	(170,883)	(200,494)	228,811	206,108
2023	52	22.31	1.03000	624,622	7,016	(13,444)	(176,009)	(206,509)	235,676	203,734
2024	53	23.31	1.03000	643,361	7,226	(13,848)	(181,290)	(212,704)	242,746	201,388
2025	54	24.31	1.03000	662,662	7,443	(14,263)	(186,728)	(219,085)	250,028	199,068
2026	55	25.31	1.03000	682,542	7,666	(14,691)	(192,330)	(225,658)	257,529	196,776
2027	56	26.31	1.03000	703,018	7,896	(15,132)	(198,100)	(232,428)	265,255	194,510
2028	57	27.31	1.03000	724,109	8,133	(15,586)	(204,043)	(239,401)	273,213	192,270
2029	58	28.31	1.03000	745,832	8,377	(16,053)	(210,164)	(246,583)	281,409	190,056
2030	59	29.31	1.03000	768,207	8,629	(16,535)	(216,469)	(253,980)	289,851	187,867
2031	60	29.64	1.03000	263,751	2,962	(5,677)	(74,321)	(87,200)	99,515	62,752
Total				\$14,497,203	\$162,817	(\$310,594)	(\$4,085,679)	(\$4,793,668)	\$5,470,078	\$4,862,248

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	29.050%	48.039%	3.743%	0.000%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits
Mr. Eric Bennett
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	401(K)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	30	0.31	\$2,512	\$0	\$0	(\$1,207)	\$1,305	\$1,305
2002	31	1.31	8,176	0	0	(3,928)	4,248	4,248
2003	32	2.31	8,748	0	0	(4,202)	4,546	4,546
2004	33	3.31	9,342	0	0	(4,488)	4,854	4,854
2005	34	4.31	9,958	0	0	(4,784)	5,174	5,174
2006	35	5.31	10,594	0	0	(5,089)	5,505	5,505
2007	36	6.31	11,249	0	0	(5,404)	5,845	5,845
2008	37	7.31	11,922	0	0	(5,727)	6,195	6,195
2009	38	8.31	12,612	0	0	(6,059)	6,553	6,553
2010	39	9.31	13,316	0	0	(6,397)	6,919	6,919
2011	40	10.31	14,032	0	0	(6,741)	7,291	7,291
2012	41	11.31	14,758	0	0	(7,090)	7,669	7,669
2013	42	12.31	15,493	0	0	(7,443)	8,050	8,050
2014	43	13.31	16,234	0	0	(7,799)	8,435	8,435
2015	44	14.31	16,977	0	0	(8,156)	8,821	8,821
2016	45	15.31	17,721	0	0	(8,513)	9,208	9,208
2017	46	16.31	18,462	0	0	(8,869)	9,593	9,593
2018	47	17.31	19,197	0	0	(9,222)	9,975	9,975
2019	48	18.31	19,924	0	0	(9,571)	10,353	10,353
2020	49	19.31	20,639	0	0	(9,915)	10,724	10,488
2021	50	20.31	21,339	0	0	(10,251)	11,088	10,407
2022	51	21.31	22,020	0	0	(10,578)	11,442	10,307
2023	52	22.31	22,681	0	0	(10,896)	11,785	10,188
2024	53	23.31	23,361	0	0	(11,223)	12,139	10,071
2025	54	24.31	24,062	0	0	(11,559)	12,503	9,955
2026	55	25.31	24,784	0	0	(11,906)	12,878	9,840
2027	56	26.31	25,528	0	0	(12,263)	13,264	9,727
2028	57	27.31	26,293	0	0	(12,631)	13,662	9,615
2029	58	28.31	27,082	0	0	(13,010)	14,072	9,504
2030	59	29.31	27,895	0	0	(13,400)	14,494	9,394
2031	60	29.64	9,577	0	0	(4,601)	4,976	3,138
Total			\$526,488	\$0	\$0	(\$252,922)	\$273,567	\$243,172

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services
Mr. Eric Bennett

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Total Services	Present Value
2001	30	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	31	1.31			0	0
2003	32	2.31			0	0
2004	33	3.31			0	0
2005	34	4.31			0	0
2006	35	5.31			0	0
2007	36	6.31			0	0
2008	37	7.31			0	0
2009	38	8.31			0	0
2010	39	9.31			0	0
2011	40	10.31			0	0
2012	41	11.31			0	0
2013	42	12.31			0	0
2014	43	13.31			0	0
2015	44	14.31			0	0
2016	45	15.31			0	0
2017	46	16.31			0	0
2018	47	17.31			0	0
2019	48	18.31			0	0
2020	49	19.31			0	0
2021	50	20.31			0	0
2022	51	21.31			0	0
2023	52	22.31			0	0
2024	53	22.81			0	0
Total			\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0

Exhibit B-2

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mr. Alejandro Castano**

December 28, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **June 9, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	3.9%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Mr. Alejandro Castano

	<u>Present Value</u>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,020,630
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	40,379
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	245,705
Total	<u><u>\$1,306,714</u></u>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
32,106	3.0%	9.700%	2,449	14.83-71.63%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Mr. Alejandro Castano
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	35	0.31	1.00000	\$9,845	\$751	\$0	(\$955)	(\$1,318)	\$8,323	\$8,323
2002	36	1.31	1.06185	34,092	2,601	(994)	(3,208)	(4,427)	28,063	28,063
2003	37	2.31	1.05983	36,132	2,756	(1,053)	(3,400)	(4,692)	29,743	29,743
2004	38	3.31	1.05781	38,221	2,916	(1,114)	(3,596)	(4,963)	31,462	31,462
2005	39	4.31	1.05580	40,353	3,078	(1,177)	(3,797)	(5,240)	33,218	33,218
2006	40	5.31	1.05379	42,524	3,244	(1,240)	(4,001)	(5,522)	35,005	35,005
2007	41	6.31	1.05179	44,726	3,412	(1,304)	(4,208)	(5,808)	36,817	36,817
2008	42	7.31	1.04979	46,953	3,582	(1,369)	(4,418)	(6,098)	38,650	38,650
2009	43	8.31	1.04779	49,197	3,753	(1,434)	(4,629)	(6,393)	37,593	37,593
2010	44	9.31	1.04579	51,450	3,925	(1,500)	(4,841)	(6,688)	39,315	39,315
2011	45	10.31	1.04380	53,703	4,097	(1,566)	(5,053)	(6,983)	41,037	41,037
2012	46	11.31	1.04182	55,949	4,268	(1,631)	(5,264)	(7,278)	42,753	42,753
2013	47	12.31	1.03984	58,178	4,438	(1,696)	(5,474)	(7,573)	44,456	44,456
2014	48	13.31	1.03786	60,380	4,606	(1,760)	(5,681)	(7,868)	46,139	46,139
2015	49	14.31	1.03588	62,547	4,771	(1,824)	(5,885)	(8,163)	47,795	47,795
2016	50	15.31	1.03391	64,668	4,933	(1,885)	(6,085)	(8,458)	49,415	49,415
2017	51	16.31	1.03194	66,734	5,091	(1,946)	(6,279)	(8,753)	50,994	50,994
2018	52	17.31	1.03000	68,736	5,243	(2,004)	(6,467)	(9,048)	52,524	52,524
2019	53	18.31	1.03000	70,798	5,401	(2,064)	(6,661)	(9,343)	54,099	54,099
2020	54	19.31	1.03000	72,922	5,563	(2,126)	(6,861)	(9,638)	55,722	55,722
2021	55	20.31	1.03000	75,109	5,730	(2,190)	(7,067)	(9,933)	57,394	57,394
2022	56	21.31	1.03000	77,362	5,901	(2,256)	(7,279)	(10,228)	59,116	59,116
2023	57	22.31	1.03000	79,683	6,078	(2,323)	(7,497)	(10,523)	60,889	60,889
2024	58	23.31	1.03000	82,074	6,261	(2,393)	(7,722)	(10,818)	62,666	62,666
2025	59	24.31	1.03000	84,536	6,449	(2,465)	(7,954)	(11,113)	64,452	64,452
2026	60	24.89	1.03000	50,793	3,875	(1,481)	(4,779)	(6,164)	16,540	12,981
Total				\$1,477,665	\$112,720	(\$42,796)	(\$139,062)	(\$357,207)	\$1,051,320	\$1,020,630

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	9.700%	14.83-71.63%	4.000%	0.000%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits
Mr. Alejandro Castano
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	401(K)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	35	0.31	\$394	\$0	\$0	(\$58)	\$335	\$335
2002	36	1.31	1,323	0	0	(196)	1,127	1,127
2003	37	2.31	1,402	0	0	(208)	1,194	1,194
2004	38	3.31	1,483	0	0	(220)	1,263	1,263
2005	39	4.31	1,566	0	0	(232)	1,334	1,334
2006	40	5.31	1,650	0	0	(245)	1,405	1,405
2007	41	6.31	1,735	0	0	(257)	1,478	1,478
2008	42	7.31	1,822	0	0	(270)	1,552	1,552
2009	43	8.31	1,909	0	0	(412)	1,497	1,497
2010	44	9.31	1,996	0	0	(430)	1,566	1,566
2011	45	10.31	2,084	0	0	(449)	1,634	1,634
2012	46	11.31	2,171	0	0	(468)	1,703	1,703
2013	47	12.31	2,257	0	0	(487)	1,771	1,771
2014	48	13.31	2,343	0	0	(505)	1,838	1,838
2015	49	14.31	2,427	0	0	(523)	1,903	1,903
2016	50	15.31	2,509	0	0	(541)	1,968	1,968
2017	51	16.31	2,589	0	0	(558)	2,031	2,031
2018	52	17.31	2,667	0	0	(575)	2,092	2,092
2019	53	18.31	2,747	0	0	(592)	2,155	2,155
2020	54	19.31	2,829	0	0	(610)	2,219	2,174
2021	55	20.31	2,914	0	0	(628)	2,286	2,155
2022	56	21.31	3,002	0	0	(647)	2,354	2,136
2023	57	22.31	3,092	0	0	(667)	2,425	2,118
2024	58	23.31	3,184	0	0	(2,281)	903	759
2025	59	24.31	3,280	0	0	(2,349)	931	753
2026	60	24.89	1,971	0	0	(1,412)	559	439
Total			\$57,345	\$0	\$0	(\$15,823)	\$41,522	\$40,379

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services
Mr. Alejandro Castano

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Total Services	Present Value
2001	35	0.31	\$4,224	\$1,104	\$5,328	\$5,328
2002	36	1.31	13,776	3,600	17,376	17,376
2003	37	2.31	13,776	3,600	17,376	17,376
2004	38	3.31	13,776	3,600	17,376	17,376
2005	39	4.31	13,776	3,600	17,376	17,376
2006	40	5.31	13,776	3,600	17,376	17,376
2007	41	6.31	9,898	2,722	12,619	12,619
2008	42	7.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2009	43	8.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2010	44	9.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2011	45	10.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2012	46	11.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2013	47	12.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2014	48	13.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2015	49	14.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2016	50	15.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2017	51	16.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2018	52	17.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2019	53	18.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,484
2020	54	19.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,372
2021	55	20.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	5,170
2022	56	21.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	4,976
2023	57	22.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	4,789
2024	58	23.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	4,610
2025	59	24.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	4,437
2026	60	25.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	4,270
2027	61	26.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	4,110
2028	62	27.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	3,955
2029	63	28.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	3,807
2030	64	29.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	3,664
2031	65	30.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	3,527
2032	66	31.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	3,394
2033	67	32.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	3,267
2034	68	33.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	3,144
2035	69	34.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	3,026
2036	70	35.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	2,913
2037	71	36.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	2,803
2038	72	37.31	4,080	1,404	5,484	2,698
2039	73	37.74	1,768	608	2,377	1,138
Total			\$211,250	\$65,958	\$277,208	\$245,705

Exhibit B-3

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mrs. Edna Cintron**

December 28, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **December 8, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES
MRS. EDNA CINTRON

	PRESENT VALUE
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$627,624
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	102,859
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	443,931
Total	\$1,174,415

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
44,234	3.0%	14.720%	2,433	22.779%

EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS
MRS. EDNA CINTRON
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	47	0.31	1.00000	\$13,564	\$746	\$0	(\$1,997)	(\$2,635)	\$9,678	\$9,678
2002	48	1.31	1.03786	45,909	2,525	(1,239)	(6,555)	(8,651)	31,989	31,989
2003	49	2.31	1.03588	47,556	2,616	(1,284)	(6,790)	(8,961)	33,137	33,137
2004	50	3.31	1.03391	49,169	2,704	(1,327)	(7,021)	(9,265)	34,260	34,260
2005	51	4.31	1.03194	50,739	2,791	(1,370)	(7,245)	(9,561)	35,355	35,355
2006	52	5.31	1.03000	52,262	2,874	(1,411)	(7,462)	(9,848)	36,415	36,415
2007	53	6.31	1.03000	53,829	2,961	(1,453)	(7,686)	(10,143)	37,508	37,508
2008	54	7.31	1.03000	55,444	3,049	(1,497)	(7,917)	(10,447)	38,633	38,633
2009	55	8.31	1.03000	57,108	3,141	(1,541)	(8,154)	(10,761)	39,792	39,792
2010	56	9.31	1.03000	58,821	3,235	(1,588)	(8,399)	(11,084)	40,986	40,986
2011	57	10.31	1.03000	60,585	3,332	(1,635)	(8,651)	(11,416)	42,216	42,216
2012	58	11.31	1.03000	62,403	3,432	(1,684)	(8,910)	(11,759)	43,482	43,482
2013	59	12.31	1.03000	64,275	3,535	(1,735)	(9,177)	(12,111)	44,786	44,786
2014	60	13.31	1.03000	66,203	3,641	(1,787)	(9,453)	(12,475)	46,130	46,130
2015	61	14.31	1.03000	68,189	3,750	(1,841)	(9,736)	(12,849)	47,514	47,514
2016	62	15.31	1.03000	70,235	3,863	(1,896)	(10,028)	(13,234)	48,939	48,939
2017	63	15.64	1.03000	24,114	1,326	(651)	(3,443)	(4,544)	16,803	16,803
Total				\$900,406	\$49,521	(\$23,937)	(\$128,623)	(\$169,742)	\$627,624	\$627,624

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	14.720%	22.779%	0.000%	0.000%

EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS
MRS. EDNA CINTRON
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PROJECTED PENSION	401(K)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	47	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	48	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	49	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	50	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	51	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	52	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	53	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	54	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	55	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	56	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	57	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	58	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	59	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	60	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	61	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	62	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	63	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	64	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	65	18.31	2,328	0	(343)	(452)	1,533	1,533
2020	66	19.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	9,010
2021	67	20.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	8,672
2022	68	21.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	8,347
2023	69	22.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	8,033
2024	70	23.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	7,732
2025	71	24.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	7,442
2026	72	25.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	7,162
2027	73	26.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	6,893
2028	74	27.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	6,635
2029	75	28.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	6,386
2030	76	29.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	6,146
2031	77	30.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	5,915
2032	78	31.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	5,693
2033	79	32.31	13,968	0	(2,056)	(2,713)	9,199	5,480
2034	80	32.64	4,656	0	(685)	(904)	3,066	1,780
Total			\$202,536	\$0	(\$29,813)	(\$39,344)	\$133,379	\$102,859

EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES**MRS. EDNA CINTRON**

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	SPOUSE'S BUSINESS	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	47	0.31	\$3,047	\$3,610	\$6,657	\$6,657
2002	48	1.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2003	49	2.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2004	50	3.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2005	51	4.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2006	52	5.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2007	53	6.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2008	54	7.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2009	55	8.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2010	56	9.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2011	57	10.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2012	58	11.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2013	59	12.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2014	60	13.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2015	61	14.31	9,936	11,772	21,708	21,708
2016	62	15.31	9,936	8,280	18,216	18,216
2017	63	16.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2018	64	17.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2019	65	18.31	9,936		9,936	9,936
2020	66	19.31	9,936		9,936	9,733
2021	67	20.31	9,936		9,936	9,367
2022	68	21.31	9,936		9,936	9,016
2023	69	22.31	9,936		9,936	8,677
2024	70	23.31	9,936		9,936	8,352
2025	71	24.31	9,936		9,936	8,038
2026	72	25.31	9,936		9,936	7,736
2027	73	26.31	9,936		9,936	7,446
2028	74	27.31	9,936		9,936	7,167
2029	75	28.31	9,936		9,936	6,898
2030	76	28.74	4,306		4,306	2,908
Total			\$285,561	\$176,698	\$462,258	\$443,931

Exhibit B-4

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mr. Louis Aversano**

December 28, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 26, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

For replacement services, the amount that was awarded by **The Fund** was \$100,000 higher than that set forth in their Valuation Model. The amount computed by the model was \$215,594, whereas the amount that **The Fund** determined to be the appropriate value of lost services was \$315,594. In order to calculate the present value of lost replacement services, we converted the monthly values in **The Fund's** valuation model to the annual amounts that could have produced the actual amount paid, assuming all else remained the same. This amount was set equal to the model's amount multiplied by 1.46383 (or \$315,594 divided by \$215,594).

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	3.4%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Mr. Louis Aversano

	<u>Present Value</u>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,166,067
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	290,716
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	363,108
Total	<u><u>\$1,819,891</u></u>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
115,618	3.0%	17.740%	3,584	12.486%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Mr. Louis Aversano
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	58	0.31	1.00000	\$35,453	\$1,099	\$0	(\$6,289)	(\$3,642)	\$26,621	\$26,621
2002	59	1.31	1.03000	119,086	3,692	(3,030)	(20,492)	(11,865)	87,391	87,391
2003	60	2.31	1.03000	122,659	3,802	(3,121)	(21,107)	(12,221)	90,013	90,013
2004	61	3.31	1.03000	126,339	3,916	(3,214)	(21,740)	(12,587)	92,713	92,713
2005	62	4.31	1.03000	130,129	4,034	(3,311)	(22,392)	(12,965)	95,494	95,494
2006	63	5.31	1.03000	134,033	4,155	(3,410)	(23,064)	(13,354)	98,359	98,359
2007	64	6.31	1.03000	138,054	4,279	(3,512)	(23,756)	(13,755)	101,310	101,310
2008	65	7.31	1.03000	142,195	4,408	(3,618)	(24,469)	(14,167)	104,349	104,349
2009	66	8.31	1.03000	146,461	4,540	(3,726)	(25,203)	(14,592)	107,480	107,480
2010	67	9.31	1.03000	150,855	4,676	(3,838)	(25,959)	(15,030)	110,704	110,704
2011	68	10.31	1.03000	155,380	4,817	(3,953)	(26,738)	(15,481)	114,025	114,025
2012	69	11.31	1.03000	160,042	4,961	(4,072)	(27,540)	(15,945)	117,446	117,446
2013	70	11.47	1.03000	27,474	852	(699)	(4,728)	(2,737)	20,161	20,161
Total				\$1,588,158	\$49,231	(\$39,505)	(\$273,476)	(\$158,341)	\$1,166,067	\$1,166,067

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	17.740%	12.486%	0.000%	4.319%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits
Mr. Louis Aversano
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Net Pension (Projected-Vested)	401(K)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	58	0.31	\$0	\$1,531	\$0	(\$191)	\$1,340	\$1,340
2002	59	1.31	0	5,143	0	(642)	4,501	4,501
2003	60	2.31	0	5,298	0	(661)	4,636	4,636
2004	61	3.31	0	5,457	0	(681)	4,775	4,775
2005	62	4.31	0	5,620	0	(702)	4,918	4,918
2006	63	5.31	0	5,789	0	(723)	5,066	5,066
2007	64	6.31	0	5,963	0	(745)	5,218	5,218
2008	65	7.31	(5,214)	6,141	925	(231)	1,621	1,621
2009	66	8.31	(6,257)	6,326	1,110	(147)	1,031	1,031
2010	67	9.31	(6,257)	6,515	1,110	(171)	1,198	1,198
2011	68	10.31	(6,257)	6,711	1,110	(195)	1,369	1,369
2012	69	11.31	(6,257)	6,912	1,110	(220)	1,545	1,545
2013	70	12.31	25,943	1,187	(4,602)	(2,813)	19,714	19,714
2014	71	13.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	23,312
2015	72	14.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	23,312
2016	73	15.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	23,312
2017	74	16.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	23,312
2018	75	17.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	23,312
2019	76	18.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	23,312
2020	77	19.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	22,895
2021	78	20.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	22,142
2022	79	21.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	21,414
2023	80	22.31	32,383	0	(5,745)	(3,326)	23,312	20,710
2024	81	22.64	10,794	0	(1,915)	(1,109)	7,770	6,751
Total			\$330,325	\$68,593	(\$58,600)	(\$42,494)	\$297,824	\$290,716

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services**Mr. Louis Aversano**

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Total Services	Present Value
2001	58	0.31	\$4,891	\$630	\$5,521	\$5,521
2002	59	1.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2003	60	2.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2004	61	3.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2005	62	4.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2006	63	5.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2007	64	6.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2008	65	7.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2009	66	8.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2010	67	9.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2011	68	10.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2012	69	11.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2013	70	12.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2014	71	13.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2015	72	14.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2016	73	15.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2017	74	16.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2018	75	17.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2019	76	18.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	18,005
2020	77	19.31	15,950	2,055	18,005	17,683
2021	78	20.23	14,728	1,898	16,625	15,811
Total			\$322,667	\$41,577	\$364,245	\$363,108

Exhibit B-5

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mrs. Ana M. Centeno**

December 28, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 18, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	3.9%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Mrs. Ana M. Centeno

	<u>Present Value</u>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,339,931
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	477,621
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	<u>0</u>
Total	<u><u>\$2,817,552</u></u>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
93,680	3.0%	20.550%	3,127	13.676%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Mrs. Ana M. Centeno
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	39	0.31	1.00000	\$28,726	\$959	\$0	(\$5,903)	(\$3,121)	\$20,661	\$20,661
2002	40	1.31	1.05379	98,719	3,296	(2,432)	(19,678)	(10,404)	69,501	69,501
2003	41	2.31	1.05179	103,832	3,466	(2,557)	(20,697)	(10,943)	73,100	73,100
2004	42	3.31	1.04979	109,001	3,639	(2,685)	(21,728)	(11,488)	76,739	76,739
2005	43	4.31	1.04779	114,210	3,813	(2,813)	(22,766)	(12,037)	80,407	80,407
2006	44	5.31	1.04579	119,440	3,987	(2,942)	(23,809)	(12,588)	84,089	84,089
2007	45	6.31	1.04380	124,672	4,162	(3,071)	(24,851)	(13,140)	87,772	87,772
2008	46	7.31	1.04182	129,885	4,336	(3,199)	(25,891)	(13,689)	91,443	91,443
2009	47	8.31	1.03984	135,059	4,509	(3,327)	(26,922)	(14,234)	95,085	95,085
2010	48	9.31	1.03786	140,172	4,680	(3,453)	(27,941)	(14,773)	98,685	98,685
2011	49	10.31	1.03588	145,202	4,847	(3,576)	(28,944)	(15,303)	102,226	102,226
2012	50	11.31	1.03391	150,126	5,012	(3,698)	(29,925)	(15,822)	105,692	105,692
2013	51	12.31	1.03194	154,921	5,172	(3,816)	(30,881)	(16,328)	109,068	109,068
2014	52	13.31	1.03000	159,569	5,327	(3,930)	(31,808)	(16,818)	112,340	112,340
2015	53	14.31	1.03000	164,356	5,487	(4,048)	(32,762)	(17,322)	115,711	115,711
2016	54	15.31	1.03000	169,287	5,652	(4,170)	(33,745)	(17,842)	119,182	119,182
2017	55	16.31	1.03000	174,365	5,821	(4,295)	(34,757)	(18,377)	122,757	122,757
2018	56	17.31	1.03000	179,596	5,996	(4,424)	(35,800)	(18,928)	126,440	126,440
2019	57	18.31	1.03000	184,984	6,176	(4,556)	(36,874)	(19,496)	130,233	130,233
2020	58	19.31	1.03000	190,534	6,361	(4,693)	(37,980)	(20,081)	134,140	131,397
2021	59	20.31	1.03000	196,250	6,552	(4,834)	(39,119)	(20,683)	138,165	130,259
2022	60	21.31	1.03000	202,137	6,748	(4,979)	(40,293)	(21,304)	142,310	129,131
2023	61	22.31	1.03000	208,201	6,951	(5,128)	(41,502)	(21,943)	146,579	128,012
Total				\$3,383,244	\$112,948	(\$82,624)	(\$674,576)	(\$356,666)	\$2,382,325	\$2,339,931

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	20.550%	13.676%	0.000%	3.416%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits

Mrs. Ana M. Centeno

Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	401(K)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	39	0.31	\$0	\$981	\$0	(\$134)	\$847	\$847
2002	40	1.31	0	3,373	0	(461)	2,911	2,911
2003	41	2.31	0	3,547	0	(485)	3,062	3,062
2004	42	3.31	0	3,724	0	(509)	3,215	3,215
2005	43	4.31	0	3,902	0	(534)	3,368	3,368
2006	44	5.31	0	4,081	0	(558)	3,522	3,522
2007	45	6.31	0	4,259	0	(582)	3,677	3,677
2008	46	7.31	0	4,437	0	(607)	3,831	3,831
2009	47	8.31	0	4,614	0	(631)	3,983	3,983
2010	48	9.31	0	4,789	0	(655)	4,134	4,134
2011	49	10.31	0	4,961	0	(678)	4,282	4,282
2012	50	11.31	0	5,129	0	(701)	4,427	4,427
2013	51	12.31	0	5,293	0	(724)	4,569	4,569
2014	52	13.31	0	5,451	0	(746)	4,706	4,706
2015	53	14.31	0	5,615	0	(768)	4,847	4,847
2016	54	15.31	0	5,783	0	(791)	4,993	4,993
2017	55	16.31	0	5,957	0	(815)	5,142	5,142
2018	56	17.31	0	6,136	0	(839)	5,297	5,297
2019	57	18.31	0	6,320	0	(864)	5,455	5,455
2020	58	19.31	0	6,509	0	(890)	5,619	5,504
2021	59	20.31	0	6,705	0	(917)	5,788	5,457
2022	60	21.31	0	6,906	0	(944)	5,961	5,409
2023	61	22.31	0	7,113	0	(973)	6,140	5,362
2024	62	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	63	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	64	25.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2027	65	26.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2028	66	27.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	34,834
2029	67	28.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	33,526
2030	68	29.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	32,268
2031	69	30.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	31,057
2032	70	31.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	29,891
2033	71	32.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	28,769
2034	72	33.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	27,689
2035	73	34.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	26,650
2036	74	35.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	25,649
2037	75	36.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	24,687
2038	76	37.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	23,760
2039	77	38.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	22,868
2040	78	39.31	70,416	0	(14,470)	(7,651)	48,295	22,010
2041	79	40.06	52,812	0	(10,853)	(5,738)	36,221	15,963
Total			\$968,220	\$115,584	(\$198,969)	(\$121,007)	\$763,828	\$477,621

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services
Mrs. Ana M. Centeno

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Total Services	Present Value
2001	39	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	40	1.31			0	0
2003	41	2.31			0	0
2004	42	3.31			0	0
2005	43	4.31			0	0
2006	44	5.31			0	0
2007	45	6.31			0	0
2008	46	7.31			0	0
2009	47	8.31			0	0
2010	48	9.31			0	0
2011	49	10.31			0	0
2012	50	11.31			0	0
2013	51	12.31			0	0
2014	52	13.31			0	0
2015	53	14.31			0	0
2016	54	15.31			0	0
2017	55	16.31			0	0
2018	56	17.31			0	0
2019	57	18.31			0	0
2020	58	19.31			0	0
2021	59	20.31			0	0
2022	60	21.31			0	0
2023	61	22.31			0	0
2024	62	22.81			0	0
Total			\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0

Exhibit B-6

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mr. Frank Bonomo**

December 28, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **December 5, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	3.9%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Mr. Frank Bonomo

	<u>Present Value</u>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,790,865
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	450,282
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	<u>0</u>
Total	<u><u>\$3,241,147</u></u>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
103,127	3.0%	21.600%	7,612	6.68-12.49%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Mr. Frank Bonomo
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	42	0.31	1.00000	\$31,623	\$2,334	\$0	(\$6,831)	(\$1,656)	\$25,471	\$25,471
2002	43	1.31	1.04779	108,056	7,975	(2,729)	(22,640)	(5,488)	85,174	85,174
2003	44	2.31	1.04579	113,004	8,340	(2,854)	(23,677)	(5,740)	89,074	89,074
2004	45	3.31	1.04380	117,954	8,706	(2,979)	(24,714)	(5,991)	92,976	92,976
2005	46	4.31	1.04182	122,887	9,070	(3,104)	(25,747)	(6,242)	96,864	96,864
2006	47	5.31	1.03984	127,782	9,431	(3,227)	(26,773)	(6,490)	100,723	100,723
2007	48	6.31	1.03786	132,619	9,788	(3,349)	(27,786)	(6,736)	104,536	104,536
2008	49	7.31	1.03588	137,378	10,139	(3,470)	(28,783)	(6,978)	108,287	108,287
2009	50	8.31	1.03391	142,036	10,483	(3,587)	(29,759)	(7,214)	111,959	111,959
2010	51	9.31	1.03194	146,573	10,818	(3,702)	(30,710)	(7,445)	115,535	115,535
2011	52	10.31	1.03000	150,971	11,143	(3,813)	(31,631)	(7,668)	119,001	119,001
2012	53	11.31	1.03000	155,500	11,477	(3,927)	(32,580)	(7,898)	122,571	122,571
2013	54	12.31	1.03000	160,165	11,821	(4,045)	(33,558)	(8,135)	126,248	126,248
2014	55	13.31	1.03000	164,970	12,176	(4,166)	(34,564)	(8,379)	130,036	130,036
2015	56	14.31	1.03000	169,919	12,541	(4,291)	(35,601)	(8,630)	133,937	133,937
2016	57	15.31	1.03000	175,016	12,917	(4,420)	(36,669)	(8,889)	137,955	137,955
2017	58	16.31	1.03000	180,267	13,305	(4,553)	(37,769)	(11,930)	139,319	139,319
2018	59	17.31	1.03000	185,675	13,704	(4,689)	(38,903)	(12,288)	143,498	143,498
2019	60	18.31	1.03000	191,245	14,115	(4,830)	(40,070)	(12,657)	147,803	147,803
2020	61	19.31	1.03000	196,982	14,539	(4,975)	(41,272)	(18,705)	146,569	143,572
2021	62	20.31	1.03000	202,892	14,975	(5,124)	(42,510)	(19,266)	150,966	142,328
2022	63	21.31	1.03000	208,979	15,424	(5,278)	(43,785)	(19,844)	155,495	141,095
2023	64	22.31	1.03000	215,248	15,887	(5,436)	(45,099)	(20,439)	160,160	139,873
2024	65	22.97	1.03000	147,804	10,909	(3,733)	(30,968)	(14,035)	109,977	93,029
Total				\$3,685,542	\$272,019	(\$92,283)	(\$772,400)	(\$238,743)	\$2,854,135	\$2,790,865

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	21.600%	6.68-12.49%	4.000%	0.000%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits
Mr. Frank Bonomo
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	Net Pension (Projected-Vested)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	42	0.31	(\$487)	\$0	\$0	\$33	(\$454)	(\$454)
2002	43	1.31	(1,664)	0	0	111	(1,553)	(1,553)
2003	44	2.31	(1,740)	0	0	116	(1,624)	(1,624)
2004	45	3.31	(1,665)	(2,521)	545	243	(3,398)	(3,398)
2005	46	4.31	0	(30,254)	6,535	1,584	(22,135)	(22,135)
2006	47	5.31	0	(30,254)	6,535	1,584	(22,135)	(22,135)
2007	48	6.31	0	(30,254)	6,535	1,584	(22,135)	(22,135)
2008	49	7.31	0	(30,254)	6,535	1,584	(22,135)	(22,135)
2009	50	8.31	5,682	(25,361)	5,478	948	(13,253)	(13,253)
2010	51	9.31	5,976	28,465	(6,148)	(1,890)	26,403	26,403
2011	52	10.31	6,273	28,465	(6,148)	(1,909)	26,680	26,680
2012	53	11.31	6,573	28,465	(6,148)	(1,929)	26,960	26,960
2013	54	12.31	6,874	28,465	(6,148)	(1,950)	27,241	27,241
2014	55	13.31	7,175	28,285	(6,110)	(1,960)	27,390	27,390
2015	56	14.31	7,475	28,105	(6,071)	(1,971)	27,539	27,539
2016	57	15.31	7,773	27,925	(6,032)	(1,981)	27,685	27,685
2017	58	16.31	8,067	27,745	(5,993)	(2,595)	27,224	27,224
2018	59	17.31	8,357	27,565	(5,954)	(2,608)	27,360	27,360
2019	60	18.31	8,640	27,565	(5,954)	(2,633)	27,618	27,618
2020	61	19.31	8,916	27,565	(5,954)	(3,812)	26,715	26,169
2021	62	20.31	9,184	27,565	(5,954)	(3,845)	26,949	25,407
2022	63	21.31	9,459	27,565	(5,954)	(3,880)	27,191	24,672
2023	64	22.31	9,743	27,565	(5,954)	(3,915)	27,439	23,963
2024	65	23.31	6,690	27,565	(5,954)	(3,534)	24,767	20,818
2025	66	24.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	15,300
2026	67	25.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	14,726
2027	68	26.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	14,173
2028	69	27.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	13,641
2029	70	28.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	13,129
2030	71	29.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	12,636
2031	72	30.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	12,162
2032	73	31.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	11,705
2033	74	32.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	11,266
2034	75	33.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	10,843
2035	76	34.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	10,436
2036	77	35.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	10,044
2037	78	36.31	0	27,565	(5,954)	(2,698)	18,913	9,667
2038	79	36.97	0	18,377	(3,969)	(1,799)	12,609	6,243
Total			\$117,302	\$646,699	(\$139,687)	(\$69,502)	\$554,812	\$450,282

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services
Mr. Frank Bonomo

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Total Services	Present Value
2001	42	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	43	1.31			0	0
2003	44	2.31			0	0
2004	45	3.31			0	0
2005	46	4.31			0	0
2006	47	5.31			0	0
2007	48	6.31			0	0
2008	49	7.31			0	0
2009	50	8.31			0	0
2010	51	9.31			0	0
2011	52	10.31			0	0
2012	53	11.31			0	0
2013	54	12.31			0	0
2014	55	13.31			0	0
2015	56	14.31			0	0
2016	57	15.31			0	0
2017	58	16.31			0	0
2018	59	17.31			0	0
2019	60	18.31			0	0
2020	61	19.31			0	0
2021	62	20.31			0	0
2022	63	21.31			0	0
2023	64	22.31			0	0
2024	65	22.81			0	0
Total			\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0

Exhibit B-7

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mrs. Laurence Abel**

December 28, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **January 21, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	3.9%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Laurence Abel

	<u>Present Value</u>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$683,172
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	26,048
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	<u>0</u>
Total	<u><u>\$709,220</u></u>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
49,987	3.0%	15.410%	3,450	63.543%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Laurence Abel
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	38	0.31	1.00000	\$15,328	\$1,058	\$0	(\$2,362)	(\$8,239)	\$5,785	\$5,785
2002	39	1.31	1.05580	52,776	3,643	(1,432)	(7,889)	(27,517)	19,582	19,582
2003	40	2.31	1.05379	55,615	3,839	(1,509)	(8,313)	(28,997)	20,635	20,635
2004	41	3.31	1.05179	58,495	4,038	(1,587)	(8,744)	(30,498)	21,704	21,704
2005	42	4.31	1.04979	61,408	4,239	(1,666)	(9,179)	(32,017)	22,785	22,785
2006	43	5.31	1.04779	64,342	4,441	(1,746)	(9,618)	(33,547)	23,873	23,873
2007	44	6.31	1.04579	67,289	4,645	(1,825)	(10,058)	(35,083)	24,967	24,967
2008	45	7.31	1.04380	70,236	4,848	(1,905)	(10,499)	(36,620)	26,060	26,060
2009	46	8.31	1.04182	73,173	5,051	(1,985)	(10,938)	(38,151)	27,150	27,150
2010	47	9.31	1.03984	76,088	5,252	(2,064)	(11,373)	(39,671)	28,232	28,232
2011	48	10.31	1.03786	78,969	5,451	(2,142)	(11,804)	(41,173)	29,300	29,300
2012	49	11.31	1.03588	81,802	5,646	(2,219)	(12,228)	(42,650)	30,352	30,352
2013	50	12.31	1.03391	84,576	5,838	(2,294)	(12,642)	(44,096)	31,381	31,381
2014	51	13.31	1.03194	87,278	6,024	(2,368)	(13,046)	(45,505)	32,383	32,383
2015	52	14.31	1.03000	89,896	6,205	(2,439)	(13,437)	(46,870)	33,355	33,355
2016	53	15.31	1.03000	92,593	6,391	(2,512)	(13,841)	(48,276)	34,355	34,355
2017	54	16.31	1.03000	95,371	6,583	(2,587)	(14,256)	(49,725)	35,386	35,386
2018	55	17.31	1.03000	98,232	6,780	(2,665)	(14,683)	(51,216)	36,448	36,448
2019	56	18.31	1.03000	101,179	6,984	(2,745)	(15,124)	(52,753)	37,541	37,541
2020	57	19.31	1.03000	104,214	7,193	(2,827)	(15,578)	(54,335)	38,667	37,877
2021	58	20.31	1.03000	107,341	7,409	(2,912)	(16,045)	(55,965)	39,827	37,548
2022	59	21.31	1.03000	110,561	7,631	(2,999)	(16,526)	(57,644)	41,022	37,223
2023	60	22.31	1.03000	113,878	7,860	(3,089)	(17,022)	(59,374)	42,253	36,901
2024	61	22.64	1.03000	39,097	2,699	(1,061)	(5,844)	(20,384)	14,506	12,349
Total				\$1,879,738	\$129,747	(\$50,579)	(\$281,048)	(\$980,307)	\$697,550	\$683,172

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	15.410%	63.543%	4.000%	0.000%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits
Laurence Abel
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	401(K)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	38	0.31	\$613	\$0	\$0	(\$390)	\$224	\$224
2002	39	1.31	2,048	0	0	(1,301)	747	747
2003	40	2.31	2,158	0	0	(1,371)	787	787
2004	41	3.31	2,270	0	0	(1,442)	827	827
2005	42	4.31	2,383	0	0	(1,514)	869	869
2006	43	5.31	2,496	0	0	(1,586)	910	910
2007	44	6.31	2,611	0	0	(1,659)	952	952
2008	45	7.31	2,725	0	0	(1,732)	994	994
2009	46	8.31	2,839	0	0	(1,804)	1,035	1,035
2010	47	9.31	2,952	0	0	(1,876)	1,076	1,076
2011	48	10.31	3,064	0	0	(1,947)	1,117	1,117
2012	49	11.31	3,174	0	0	(2,017)	1,157	1,157
2013	50	12.31	3,282	0	0	(2,085)	1,196	1,196
2014	51	13.31	3,386	0	0	(2,152)	1,235	1,235
2015	52	14.31	3,488	0	0	(2,216)	1,272	1,272
2016	53	15.31	3,593	0	0	(2,283)	1,310	1,310
2017	54	16.31	3,700	0	0	(2,351)	1,349	1,349
2018	55	17.31	3,811	0	0	(2,422)	1,390	1,390
2019	56	18.31	3,926	0	0	(2,495)	1,431	1,431
2020	57	19.31	4,044	0	0	(2,569)	1,474	1,444
2021	58	20.31	4,165	0	0	(2,646)	1,518	1,432
2022	59	21.31	4,290	0	0	(2,726)	1,564	1,419
2023	60	22.31	4,418	0	0	(2,808)	1,611	1,407
2024	61	22.64	1,517	0	0	(964)	553	471
Total			\$72,952	\$0	\$0	(\$46,356)	\$26,596	\$26,048

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services
Laurence Abel

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Total Services	Present Value
2001	38	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	39	1.31			0	0
2003	40	2.31			0	0
2004	41	3.31			0	0
2005	42	4.31			0	0
2006	43	5.31			0	0
2007	44	6.31			0	0
2008	45	7.31			0	0
2009	46	8.31			0	0
2010	47	9.31			0	0
2011	48	10.31			0	0
2012	49	11.31			0	0
2013	50	12.31			0	0
2014	51	13.31			0	0
2015	52	14.31			0	0
2016	53	15.31			0	0
2017	54	16.31			0	0
2018	55	17.31			0	0
2019	56	18.31			0	0
2020	57	19.31			0	0
2021	58	20.31			0	0
2022	59	21.31			0	0
2023	60	22.31			0	0
2024	61	22.81			0	0
Total			\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0

Exhibit B-8

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mr. Michael S. Curtin**

December 29, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **March 12, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	3.9%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Mr. Michael S. Curtin

	Present Value
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,270,814
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	547,226
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	148,455
Total	\$2,966,495

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
97,261	3.0%	14.060%	7,595	5.42-12.49%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Mr. Michael S. Curtin
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	45	0.31	1.00000	\$29,824	\$2,329	\$0	(\$4,193)	(\$1,389)	\$26,571	\$26,571
2002	46	1.31	1.04182	101,328	7,913	(2,816)	(13,819)	(4,577)	88,028	88,028
2003	47	2.31	1.03984	105,364	8,228	(2,929)	(14,370)	(4,759)	91,534	91,534
2004	48	3.31	1.03786	109,353	8,540	(3,040)	(14,914)	(4,940)	95,000	95,000
2005	49	4.31	1.03588	113,277	8,846	(3,149)	(15,449)	(5,117)	98,408	98,408
2006	50	5.31	1.03391	117,118	9,146	(3,255)	(15,973)	(6,521)	100,515	100,515
2007	51	6.31	1.03194	120,859	9,438	(3,359)	(16,483)	(8,768)	101,687	101,687
2008	52	7.31	1.03000	124,485	9,721	(3,460)	(16,977)	(9,031)	104,737	104,737
2009	53	8.31	1.03000	128,219	10,013	(3,564)	(17,487)	(13,346)	103,835	103,835
2010	54	9.31	1.03000	132,066	10,313	(3,671)	(18,011)	(13,747)	106,950	106,950
2011	55	10.31	1.03000	136,028	10,623	(3,781)	(18,552)	(14,159)	110,159	110,159
2012	56	11.31	1.03000	140,109	10,941	(3,894)	(19,108)	(14,584)	113,464	113,464
2013	57	12.31	1.03000	144,312	11,270	(4,011)	(19,682)	(15,021)	116,867	116,867
2014	58	13.31	1.03000	148,641	11,608	(4,132)	(20,272)	(15,472)	120,373	120,373
2015	59	14.31	1.03000	153,101	11,956	(4,255)	(20,880)	(15,936)	123,985	123,985
2016	60	15.31	1.03000	157,694	12,315	(4,383)	(21,507)	(16,414)	127,704	127,704
2017	61	16.31	1.03000	162,424	12,684	(4,515)	(22,152)	(16,907)	131,535	131,535
2018	62	17.31	1.03000	167,297	13,064	(4,650)	(22,816)	(17,414)	135,481	135,481
2019	63	18.31	1.03000	172,316	13,456	(4,790)	(23,501)	(17,936)	139,546	139,546
2020	64	19.31	1.03000	177,486	13,860	(4,933)	(24,206)	(18,474)	143,732	140,793
2021	65	19.97	1.03000	121,873	9,517	(3,388)	(16,621)	(12,686)	98,696	93,641
Total				\$2,763,174	\$215,780	(\$75,974)	(\$376,973)	(\$247,198)	\$2,278,809	\$2,270,814

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	14.060%	5.42-12.49%	4.000%	0.000%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits
Mr. Michael S. Curtin
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	Net Pension (Projected-Vested)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	45	0.31	(\$318)	\$0	\$0	\$17	(\$301)	(\$301)
2002	46	1.31	(1,081)	0	0	59	(1,022)	(1,022)
2003	47	2.31	(1,169)	0	0	63	(1,106)	(1,106)
2004	48	3.31	(1,212)	0	0	66	(1,147)	(1,147)
2005	49	4.31	(1,256)	0	0	68	(1,188)	(1,188)
2006	50	5.31	(1,298)	0	0	87	(1,212)	(1,212)
2007	51	6.31	(1,340)	0	0	117	(1,224)	(1,224)
2008	52	7.31	5,059	24,195	(3,402)	(2,250)	23,602	23,602
2009	53	8.31	5,421	26,394	(3,711)	(3,509)	24,595	24,595
2010	54	9.31	5,669	26,394	(3,711)	(3,540)	24,812	24,812
2011	55	10.31	5,917	26,394	(3,711)	(3,571)	25,029	25,029
2012	56	11.31	6,165	26,394	(3,711)	(3,602)	25,246	25,246
2013	57	12.31	6,410	26,394	(3,711)	(3,633)	25,461	25,461
2014	58	13.31	6,653	26,394	(3,711)	(3,663)	25,673	25,673
2015	59	14.31	6,892	26,394	(3,711)	(3,693)	25,882	25,882
2016	60	15.31	7,125	26,394	(3,711)	(3,722)	26,086	26,086
2017	61	16.31	7,353	26,394	(3,711)	(3,750)	26,286	26,286
2018	62	17.31	7,574	26,394	(3,711)	(3,778)	26,479	26,479
2019	63	18.31	7,801	26,394	(3,711)	(3,806)	26,678	26,678
2020	64	19.31	8,035	26,394	(3,711)	(3,836)	26,882	26,333
2021	65	20.31	5,517	26,394	(3,711)	(3,521)	24,679	23,267
2022	66	21.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	18,012
2023	67	22.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	17,336
2024	68	23.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	16,686
2025	69	24.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	16,059
2026	70	25.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	15,456
2027	71	26.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	14,876
2028	72	27.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	14,318
2029	73	28.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	13,780
2030	74	29.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	13,263
2031	75	30.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	12,765
2032	76	31.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	12,286
2033	77	32.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	11,825
2034	78	33.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	11,381
2035	79	34.31	0	26,394	(3,711)	(2,832)	19,851	10,954
Total			\$83,916	\$736,833	(\$103,599)	(\$89,051)	\$628,099	\$547,226

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services**Mr. Michael S. Curtin**

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Total Services	Present Value
2001	45	0.31	\$4,246	\$2,414	\$6,660	\$6,660
2002	46	1.31	13,848	7,872	21,720	21,720
2003	47	2.31	13,848	7,872	21,720	21,720
2004	48	3.31	13,848	7,872	21,720	21,720
2005	49	4.31	15,120	6,224	21,344	21,344
2006	50	5.31	15,935	4,893	20,828	20,828
2007	51	6.31	13,776	3,600	17,376	17,376
2008	52	7.29	13,547	3,540	17,087	17,087
Total			\$104,168	\$44,287	\$148,455	\$148,455

Exhibit B-9

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mr. Mohammad Chowdhury**

December 28, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 13, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

For replacement services, the amount that was awarded by **The Fund** was \$300,000 higher than that set forth in their Valuation Model. The amount computed by the model was \$420,543, whereas the amount that **The Fund** determined to be the appropriate value of lost services was \$720,543. In order to calculate the present value of lost replacement services, we converted the monthly values in **The Fund's** valuation model to the annual amounts that could have produced the actual amount paid, assuming all else remained the same. This amount was set equal to the model's amount multiplied by 1.71336 (or \$720,543 divided by \$420,543).

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	3.9%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Mr. Mohammad Chowdhury

	<u>Present Value</u>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$2,041,699
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	92,053
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	812,570
Total	<u><u>\$2,946,322</u></u>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
63,664	3.0%	17.270%	2,981	9.12-17.81%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Mr. Mohammad Chowdhury
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	39	0.31	1.00000	\$19,522	\$914	\$0	(\$3,371)	(\$1,473)	\$15,591	\$15,591
2002	40	1.31	1.05379	67,089	3,141	(1,743)	(11,239)	(4,912)	52,336	52,336
2003	41	2.31	1.05179	70,563	3,304	(1,833)	(11,821)	(5,166)	55,047	55,047
2004	42	3.31	1.04979	74,076	3,468	(1,925)	(12,409)	(5,423)	57,787	57,787
2005	43	4.31	1.04779	77,616	3,634	(2,017)	(13,002)	(5,683)	60,549	60,549
2006	44	5.31	1.04579	81,171	3,800	(2,109)	(13,598)	(5,943)	63,322	63,322
2007	45	6.31	1.04380	84,726	3,967	(2,201)	(14,193)	(6,203)	66,095	66,095
2008	46	7.31	1.04182	88,269	4,133	(2,293)	(14,787)	(6,463)	68,859	68,859
2009	47	8.31	1.03984	91,786	4,297	(2,385)	(15,376)	(6,720)	71,602	71,602
2010	48	9.31	1.03786	95,260	4,460	(2,475)	(15,958)	(6,974)	74,313	74,313
2011	49	10.31	1.03588	98,678	4,620	(2,564)	(16,530)	(7,225)	76,979	76,979
2012	50	11.31	1.03391	102,024	4,777	(2,651)	(17,091)	(7,470)	79,590	79,590
2013	51	12.31	1.03194	105,283	4,929	(2,735)	(17,637)	(7,708)	82,132	82,132
2014	52	13.31	1.03000	108,442	5,077	(2,817)	(18,166)	(7,939)	84,596	84,596
2015	53	14.31	1.03000	111,695	5,229	(2,902)	(18,711)	(10,816)	84,496	84,496
2016	54	15.31	1.03000	115,046	5,386	(2,989)	(19,272)	(11,140)	87,031	87,031
2017	55	16.31	1.03000	118,497	5,548	(3,079)	(19,851)	(11,474)	89,642	89,642
2018	56	17.31	1.03000	122,052	5,714	(3,171)	(20,446)	(11,818)	92,331	92,331
2019	57	18.31	1.03000	125,714	5,886	(3,266)	(21,059)	(12,173)	95,101	95,101
2020	58	19.31	1.03000	129,485	6,062	(3,364)	(21,691)	(12,538)	97,954	95,951
2021	59	20.31	1.03000	133,370	6,244	(3,465)	(22,342)	(19,064)	94,743	89,322
2022	60	21.31	1.03000	137,371	6,432	(3,569)	(23,012)	(19,636)	97,585	88,548
2023	61	22.31	1.03000	141,492	6,625	(3,676)	(23,703)	(20,225)	100,513	87,781
2024	62	23.31	1.03000	145,737	6,823	(3,786)	(24,414)	(20,832)	103,528	87,021
2025	63	24.31	1.03000	150,109	7,028	(3,900)	(25,146)	(21,457)	106,634	86,267
2026	64	25.31	1.03000	154,612	7,239	(4,017)	(25,900)	(22,100)	109,833	85,520
2027	65	26.06	1.03000	119,439	5,592	(3,103)	(20,008)	(17,073)	84,847	63,888
Total				\$2,869,127	\$134,330	(\$74,036)	(\$480,734)	(\$295,648)	\$2,153,039	\$2,041,699

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	17.270%	9.12-17.81%	4.000%	0.000%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits
Mr. Mohammad Chowdhury
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	401(K)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	39	0.31	\$781	\$0	\$0	(\$71)	\$710	\$710
2002	40	1.31	2,603	0	0	(237)	2,366	2,366
2003	41	2.31	2,738	0	0	(250)	2,488	2,488
2004	42	3.31	2,874	0	0	(262)	2,612	2,612
2005	43	4.31	3,012	0	0	(275)	2,737	2,737
2006	44	5.31	3,149	0	0	(287)	2,862	2,862
2007	45	6.31	3,287	0	0	(300)	2,987	2,987
2008	46	7.31	3,425	0	0	(312)	3,112	3,112
2009	47	8.31	3,561	0	0	(325)	3,236	3,236
2010	48	9.31	3,696	0	0	(337)	3,359	3,359
2011	49	10.31	3,829	0	0	(349)	3,479	3,479
2012	50	11.31	3,959	0	0	(361)	3,597	3,597
2013	51	12.31	4,085	0	0	(373)	3,712	3,712
2014	52	13.31	4,208	0	0	(384)	3,824	3,824
2015	53	14.31	4,334	0	0	(523)	3,811	3,811
2016	54	15.31	4,464	0	0	(539)	3,925	3,925
2017	55	16.31	4,598	0	0	(555)	4,043	4,043
2018	56	17.31	4,736	0	0	(571)	4,164	4,164
2019	57	18.31	4,878	0	0	(589)	4,289	4,289
2020	58	19.31	5,024	0	0	(606)	4,418	4,327
2021	59	20.31	5,175	0	0	(922)	4,253	4,010
2022	60	21.31	5,330	0	0	(949)	4,381	3,975
2023	61	22.31	5,490	0	0	(978)	4,512	3,940
2024	62	23.31	5,655	0	0	(1,007)	4,647	3,906
2025	63	24.31	5,824	0	0	(1,037)	4,787	3,873
2026	64	25.31	5,999	0	0	(1,069)	4,930	3,839
2027	65	26.06	4,634	0	0	(825)	3,809	2,868
Total			\$111,346	\$0	\$0	(\$14,295)	\$97,051	\$92,053

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services
Mr. Mohammad Chowdhury

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Translation and Transportation	Total Services	Present Value
2001	39	0.31	\$8,448	\$2,616	\$2,654	\$13,719	\$13,719
2002	40	1.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2003	41	2.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2004	42	3.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2005	43	4.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2006	44	5.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2007	45	6.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2008	46	7.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2009	47	8.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2010	48	9.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2011	49	10.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2012	50	11.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2013	51	12.31	27,551	8,533	8,656	44,739	44,739
2014	52	13.31	26,599	7,962	8,656	43,218	43,218
2015	53	14.31	23,603	6,168	8,656	38,427	38,427
2016	54	15.31	23,603	6,168	8,656	38,427	38,427
2017	55	16.31	23,603	6,168	8,656	38,427	38,427
2018	56	17.31	23,603	6,168	8,656	38,427	38,427
2019	57	18.31	23,603	6,168	8,656	38,427	38,427
2020	58	19.01	16,602	4,338	6,088	27,028	26,625
Total			\$500,276	\$148,148	\$164,549	\$812,973	\$812,570

Exhibit B-10

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mr. Gary Michael Albero**

December 28, 2019

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **The Fund** dated **May 18, 2004**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **The Fund's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **The Fund** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **The Fund's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	5.0%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Mr. Gary Michael Alberio

	Present Value
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$7,497,741
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	757,326
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	469,246
Total	\$8,724,313

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
326,846	3.0%	33.26-35.17%	8,759	9.98-12.53%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Mr. Gary Michael Albero
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	39	0.31	1.00000	\$100,224	\$2,686	\$0	(\$33,332)	(\$6,849)	\$62,729	\$62,729
2002	40	1.31	1.05379	344,428	9,021	(7,077)	(111,113)	(22,830)	212,429	212,429
2003	41	2.31	1.05179	362,265	9,756	(7,449)	(116,868)	(24,012)	223,692	223,692
2004	42	3.31	1.04979	380,300	10,154	(7,818)	(122,686)	(25,207)	234,743	234,743
2005	43	4.31	1.04779	398,474	10,570	(8,190)	(128,549)	(26,412)	245,894	245,894
2006	44	5.31	1.04579	416,722	11,003	(8,564)	(134,436)	(27,621)	257,103	257,103
2007	45	6.31	1.04380	434,976	11,453	(8,939)	(140,324)	(28,831)	268,335	268,335
2008	46	7.31	1.04182	453,166	11,920	(9,312)	(146,192)	(30,037)	279,544	279,544
2009	47	8.31	1.03984	471,218	12,287	(9,404)	(160,755)	(29,580)	283,765	283,765
2010	48	9.31	1.03786	489,056	12,790	(9,760)	(166,841)	(30,700)	294,545	294,545
2011	49	10.31	1.03588	506,604	13,313	(10,112)	(172,828)	(31,802)	305,177	305,177
2012	50	11.31	1.03391	523,784	13,857	(10,457)	(178,688)	(32,880)	315,616	315,616
2013	51	12.31	1.03194	540,515	14,425	(10,793)	(184,396)	(33,930)	325,820	325,820
2014	52	13.31	1.03000	556,730	15,013	(11,120)	(189,928)	(34,948)	335,747	335,747
2015	53	14.31	1.03000	573,432	15,628	(11,457)	(195,626)	(35,997)	345,981	345,981
2016	54	15.31	1.03000	590,635	16,267	(11,804)	(201,495)	(37,077)	356,527	356,527
2017	55	16.31	1.03000	608,354	16,933	(12,161)	(207,539)	(38,189)	367,397	367,397
2018	56	17.31	1.03000	626,605	17,625	(12,530)	(213,766)	(39,335)	378,599	378,599
2019	57	18.31	1.03000	645,403	18,348	(12,909)	(220,178)	(40,515)	390,148	390,148
2020	58	19.31	1.03000	664,765	19,097	(13,300)	(226,784)	(52,387)	391,390	381,277
2021	59	20.31	1.03000	684,708	19,877	(13,703)	(233,587)	(53,958)	403,335	374,309
2022	60	21.31	1.03000	705,249	20,690	(14,119)	(240,595)	(55,577)	415,648	367,470
2023	61	22.31	1.03000	726,406	21,538	(14,547)	(247,813)	(57,244)	428,341	360,760
2024	62	23.31	1.03000	748,199	22,419	(14,988)	(255,247)	(58,962)	441,421	354,172
2025	63	23.81	1.03000	385,323	11,666	(7,721)	(131,453)	(30,365)	227,450	175,960
Total				\$12,937,539	\$358,337	(\$258,233)	(\$4,361,019)	(\$885,246)	\$7,791,377	\$7,497,741

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	401(k) Contrib. Rate	Pension Contrib. Rate
3.0%	33.26-35.17%	9.98-12.53%	5.960%	0.000%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits
Mr. Gary Michael Albero
Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	401(k) Contrib.	Net Pension (Projected-Vested)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	39	0.31	\$4,155	\$0	\$0	(\$425.43)	\$3,730	\$3,730
2002	40	1.31	7,657	0	0	(784)	6,873	6,873
2003	41	2.31	8,771	0	0	(898)	7,873	7,873
2004	42	3.31	9,602	0	0	(983)	8,619	8,619
2005	43	4.31	10,450	0	0	(1,070)	9,381	9,381
2006	44	5.31	11,315	0	0	(1,159)	10,157	10,157
2007	45	6.31	11,664	0	0	(1,194)	10,470	10,470
2008	46	7.31	12,023	0	0	(1,231)	10,792	10,792
2009	47	8.31	12,394	0	0	(1,237)	11,156	11,156
2010	48	9.31	12,775	0	0	(1,275)	11,500	11,500
2011	49	10.31	13,169	0	0	(1,315)	11,854	11,854
2012	50	11.31	13,574	0	0	(1,355)	12,219	12,219
2013	51	12.31	13,992	0	0	(1,397)	12,596	12,596
2014	52	13.31	14,423	0	0	(1,440)	12,984	12,984
2015	53	14.31	14,868	0	0	(1,484)	13,383	13,383
2016	54	15.31	15,325	0	0	(1,530)	13,796	13,796
2017	55	16.31	15,797	0	0	(1,577)	14,220	14,220
2018	56	17.31	16,284	0	0	(1,626)	14,658	14,658
2019	57	18.31	16,786	0	0	(1,676)	15,110	15,110
2020	58	19.31	17,302	0	0	(2,168)	15,134	14,743
2021	59	20.31	17,835	0	0	(2,235)	15,600	14,478
2022	60	21.31	18,385	0	0	(2,304)	16,081	14,217
2023	61	22.31	18,951	0	0	(2,375)	16,576	13,961
2024	62	23.31	19,535	0	0	(2,448)	17,087	13,709
2025	63	24.31	20,136	0	0	(2,523)	17,613	13,462
2026	64	25.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2027	65	26.31	0	58,417	(20,545)	(4,746)	33,126	22,979
2028	66	27.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	43,781
2029	67	28.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	41,708
2030	68	29.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	39,733
2031	69	30.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	37,852
2032	70	31.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	36,060
2033	71	32.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	34,352
2034	72	33.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	32,725
2035	73	34.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	31,176
2036	74	35.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	29,700
2037	75	36.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	28,293
2038	76	37.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	26,954
2039	77	38.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	25,677
2040	78	39.31	0	116,834	(41,091)	(9,492)	66,252	24,461
2041	79	39.56	0	29,209	(10,273)	(2,373)	16,563	5,932
Total			\$347,170	\$1,606,468	(\$564,995)	(\$168,221)	\$1,220,422	\$757,326

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services
Mr. Gary Michael Albero

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Total Services	Present Value
2001	39	0.31	\$4,795	\$1,104	\$5,899	\$5,899
2002	40	1.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2003	41	2.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2004	42	3.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2005	43	4.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2006	44	5.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2007	45	6.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2008	46	7.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2009	47	8.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2010	48	9.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2011	49	10.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2012	50	11.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2013	51	12.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2014	52	13.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2015	53	14.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2016	54	15.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2017	55	16.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2018	56	17.31	15,636	3,600	19,236	19,236
2019	57	18.31	12,195	986	13,181	13,181
2020	58	19.31	10,896	0	10,896	10,614
2021	59	20.31	10,896	0	10,896	10,112
2022	60	21.31	10,896	0	10,896	9,633
2023	61	22.31	10,896	0	10,896	9,177
2024	62	23.31	10,896	0	10,896	8,742
2025	63	24.31	10,896	0	10,896	8,328
2026	64	25.31	10,896	0	10,896	7,934
2027	65	26.31	10,896	0	10,896	7,558
2028	66	27.31	10,896	0	10,896	7,200
2029	67	28.31	10,896	0	10,896	6,860
2030	68	29.31	10,896	0	10,896	6,535
2031	69	30.31	10,896	0	10,896	6,225
2032	70	31.31	10,896	0	10,896	5,930
2033	71	32.31	10,896	0	10,896	5,650
2034	72	33.31	10,896	0	10,896	5,382
2035	73	34.31	10,896	0	10,896	5,127
2036	74	34.74	4,722	0	4,722	2,146
Total			\$461,859	\$63,290	\$525,149	\$469,246

Exhibit B-11

Valuation Date	01-Jan-20
Discount Rate	3.9%

Exhibit 1. Summary of Economic Damages
Mr. Sandy Ayala

	<u>Present Value</u>
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$1,228,178
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	0
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	307,828
Total	<u><u>\$1,536,006</u></u>

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
30,180	3.0%	12.250%	4,829	16.9-26.7%

Exhibit 2a. Present Value of Lost Earnings
Mr. Sandy Ayala
 Worklife to Age 65

Year	Age	Time Frame	Age-Specific Growth Factor	Earnings	Benefits	Unempl. Adj.	Taxes	Consumption	Net Earnings	PV of Net Earnings
2001	36	0.31	1.00000	\$9,254	\$1,481	\$0	(\$1,134)	(\$1,372)	\$8,229	\$8,229
2002	37	1.31	1.05983	31,986	5,118	(977)	(3,801)	(4,601)	27,725	27,725
2003	38	2.31	1.05781	33,835	5,414	(1,033)	(4,020)	(4,867)	29,328	29,328
2004	39	3.31	1.05580	35,723	5,716	(1,091)	(4,245)	(5,139)	30,964	30,964
2005	40	4.31	1.05379	37,645	6,023	(1,150)	(4,473)	(5,415)	32,630	32,630
2006	41	5.31	1.05179	39,594	6,335	(1,209)	(4,705)	(5,696)	34,320	34,320
2007	42	6.31	1.04979	41,565	6,650	(1,269)	(4,939)	(5,979)	36,028	36,028
2008	43	7.31	1.04779	43,552	6,968	(1,330)	(5,175)	(6,262)	37,755	37,755
2009	44	8.31	1.04579	45,546	7,287	(1,391)	(5,412)	(6,551)	39,504	39,504
2010	45	9.31	1.04380	47,541	7,607	(1,452)	(5,649)	(6,846)	41,284	41,284
2011	46	10.31	1.04182	49,529	7,925	(1,512)	(5,885)	(7,141)	43,623	43,623
2012	47	11.31	1.03984	51,502	8,240	(1,573)	(6,120)	(7,435)	45,927	45,927
2013	48	12.31	1.03786	53,452	8,552	(1,632)	(6,351)	(7,728)	48,229	48,229
2014	49	13.31	1.03588	55,370	8,859	(1,691)	(6,579)	(8,020)	50,550	50,550
2015	50	14.31	1.03391	57,248	9,160	(1,748)	(6,802)	(8,310)	52,896	52,896
2016	51	15.31	1.03194	59,076	9,452	(1,804)	(7,020)	(8,603)	55,253	55,253
2017	52	16.31	1.03000	60,848	9,736	(1,858)	(7,230)	(8,899)	57,619	57,619
2018	53	17.31	1.03000	62,674	10,028	(1,914)	(7,447)	(9,198)	59,997	59,997
2019	54	18.31	1.03000	64,554	10,329	(1,971)	(7,671)	(9,500)	62,362	62,362
2020	55	19.31	1.03000	66,491	10,639	(2,030)	(7,901)	(9,805)	64,751	64,751
2021	56	20.31	1.03000	68,486	10,958	(2,091)	(8,138)	(10,113)	67,155	67,155
2022	57	21.31	1.03000	70,540	11,286	(2,154)	(8,382)	(10,424)	69,584	69,584
2023	58	22.31	1.03000	72,656	11,625	(2,219)	(8,633)	(10,738)	72,034	72,034
2024	59	23.31	1.03000	74,836	11,974	(2,285)	(8,892)	(11,055)	74,509	74,509
2025	60	24.31	1.03000	77,081	12,333	(2,354)	(9,159)	(11,375)	77,007	77,007
2026	61	25.31	1.03000	79,393	12,703	(2,424)	(9,434)	(11,700)	79,532	79,532
2027	62	26.31	1.03000	81,775	13,084	(2,497)	(9,717)	(12,028)	82,083	82,083
2028	63	27.31	1.03000	84,229	13,477	(2,572)	(10,008)	(12,360)	84,651	84,651
2029	64	28.31	1.03000	86,755	13,881	(2,649)	(10,309)	(12,696)	87,235	87,235
2030	65	28.91	1.03000	53,615	8,578	(1,637)	(6,371)	(12,185)	42,000	28,277
Total				\$1,696,353	\$271,416	(\$51,519)	(\$201,603)	(\$366,408)	\$1,348,239	\$1,228,178

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	12.250%	16.9-26.7%	0.000%	0.000%

Exhibit 3a. Present Value of Lost Pension Benefits

Mr. Sandy Ayala

Special Master Worklife

Year	Age	Time Frame	Pension Contrib.	Net Pension (Projected-Vested)	Taxes	Consumption	Net Loss	PV of Net Loss
2001	36	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	37	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	38	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	39	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	40	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	41	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	42	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	43	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	44	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	45	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	46	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	47	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	48	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	49	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	50	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	51	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	52	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	53	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	54	18.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2020	55	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	56	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	57	21.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2023	58	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	59	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	60	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	61	25.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2027	62	26.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2028	63	27.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2029	64	28.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2030	65	29.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2031	66	30.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2032	67	31.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2033	68	32.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2034	69	33.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2035	70	33.89	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total			\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0

Exhibit 4a. Loss Estimated Value of Replacement Services
Mr. Sandy Ayala

Year	Age	Time Frame	Household Services	Care Services	Total Services	Present Value
2001	36	0.31	\$2,392	\$2,047	\$4,439	\$4,439
2002	37	1.31	8,112	6,810	14,922	14,922
2003	38	2.31	8,436	6,947	15,383	15,383
2004	39	3.31	8,774	7,224	15,998	15,998
2005	40	4.31	9,125	7,513	16,638	16,638
2006	41	5.31	9,490	7,814	17,304	17,304
2007	42	6.31	9,869	8,126	17,996	17,996
2008	43	7.31	2,053	2,113	4,166	4,166
2009	44	8.31	2,135	2,197	4,332	4,332
2010	45	9.31	2,220	2,285	4,506	4,506
2011	46	10.31	2,309	2,377	4,686	4,686
2012	47	11.31	2,402	2,472	4,873	4,873
2013	48	12.31	2,498	2,571	5,068	5,068
2014	49	13.31	2,598	2,673	5,271	5,271
2015	50	14.31	2,701	2,780	5,482	5,482
2016	51	15.31	2,809	2,892	5,701	5,701
2017	52	16.31	2,922	3,007	5,929	5,929
2018	53	17.31	3,039	3,128	6,166	6,166
2019	54	18.31	3,160	3,253	6,413	6,413
2020	55	19.31	3,287	3,383	6,669	6,533
2021	56	20.31	3,418	3,518	6,936	6,539
2022	57	21.31	3,555	3,659	7,214	6,546
2023	58	22.31	3,697	3,805	7,502	6,552
2024	59	23.31	3,845	3,957	7,802	6,558
2025	60	24.31	3,999	4,116	8,114	6,565
2026	61	25.31	4,159	4,280	8,439	6,571
2027	62	26.31	4,325	4,452	8,777	6,577
2028	63	27.31	4,498	4,630	9,128	6,584
2029	64	28.31	4,678	4,815	9,493	6,590
2030	65	29.31	4,865	5,007	9,872	6,596
2031	66	30.31	5,060	5,208	10,267	6,603
2032	67	31.31	5,262	5,416	10,678	6,609
2033	68	32.31	5,473	5,633	11,105	6,615
2034	69	33.31	5,691	5,858	11,549	6,622
2035	70	34.31	5,919	6,092	12,011	6,628
2036	71	35.31	6,156	6,336	12,492	6,634
2037	72	36.31	6,402	6,589	12,991	6,641
2038	73	37.31	6,658	6,853	13,511	6,647
2039	74	38.31	6,925	7,127	14,052	6,654
2040	75	39.31	7,202	7,412	14,614	6,660
2041	76	39.91	4,494	4,625	9,119	4,030
Total			\$196,611	\$191,001	\$387,611	\$307,828

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mr. Sandy Ayala**

January 8, 2020

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **Frank D. Tinari, Ph.D.** dated **December 22, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **Mr. Tinari's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **Mr. Tinari** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **Mr. Tinari's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,



John E. Beauzile

Exhibit B-12

John E. Beauzile

28 Penny Lane

Binghamton, NY 13905

Email: jeb2235@columbia.edu

Jerry S. Goldman

Anderson Kill

1760 Market Street, Suite 600

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Re: Update of Analysis of Economic Loss in the Matter of
The Estate of **Mr. Kevin Cleary**

January 7, 2020

Dear Mr. Goldman,

You have asked me to update the present value numbers in the analysis of the likely economic loss award from the September 11th Victim Compensation Fund prepared by **Thomas A. Barocci, Ph.D.** dated **July 7, 2003**. I have used their assumptions for wages, benefits, taxes, personal consumption, replacement services, and discount rate to estimate those values and bring them to the present. The valuation date chosen is **January 1, 2020**.

In preparing this update, the only document reviewed is **Mr. Barocci's** report. This update assumes the reader is familiar with the methodology used and assumptions made by **Mr. Barocci** and, therefore, they will not be restated here.

The update of **Mr. Barocci's** analysis is summarized in four (4) sets of Exhibits.

- *Exhibit 1* provides the summary of Lost Earnings, Retirement Benefits, and Lost of Replacement Services;
- The set of *Exhibits 2s* shows the details behind the loss of earnings numbers;
- The *Exhibit 3* set provides supporting documentation for Retirement Benefits;
- The loss of Replacement Services amounts are in *Exhibits 4s*.

I believe that I have already provided you with a copy of my curriculum vitae. If you need a copy, please let me know.

Sincerely,

John E. Beauzile



VALUATION DATE	01-JAN-20
DISCOUNT RATE	3.9%

EXHIBIT 1. SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC DAMAGES
MR. KEVIN CLEARY

	PRESENT VALUE
Present Value of Lost Earnings	\$3,315,667
Present Value of Retirement Benefits	0
Present Value of Lost Replacement Services	0
Total	\$3,315,667

Base Salary	Unempl.	Tax Rate	Benefits	Pers. Consump.
273,532	3.0%	41.300%	0	48.000%

EXHIBIT 2A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST EARNINGS
MR. KEVIN CLEARY
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	AGE- SPECIFIC GROWTH FACTOR	EARNINGS	BENEFITS	UNEMPL. ADJ.	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET EARNINGS	PV OF NET EARNINGS
2001	38	0.31	1.00000	\$83,876	\$1,471	\$0	(\$34,641)	(\$23,633)	\$27,073	\$27,073
2002	39	1.31	1.05580	291,752	4,934	(5,225)	(116,879)	(79,738)	94,845	94,845
2003	40	2.31	1.05379	308,032	5,033	(5,513)	(123,401)	(84,187)	99,964	99,964
2004	41	3.31	1.05179	324,601	5,133	(5,807)	(130,038)	(88,716)	105,173	105,173
2005	42	4.31	1.04979	341,412	5,236	(6,104)	(136,773)	(93,310)	110,460	110,460
2006	43	5.31	1.04779	358,411	5,341	(6,406)	(143,583)	(97,956)	115,807	115,807
2007	44	6.31	1.04579	375,540	5,448	(6,709)	(150,445)	(102,638)	121,196	121,196
2008	45	7.31	1.04380	392,736	5,557	(7,014)	(157,334)	(107,338)	126,608	126,608
2009	46	8.31	1.04182	409,937	5,668	(7,319)	(164,225)	(112,039)	132,023	132,023
2010	47	9.31	1.03984	427,081	5,781	(7,623)	(171,093)	(116,724)	137,422	137,422
2011	48	10.31	1.03786	444,096	5,897	(7,924)	(177,909)	(121,375)	142,785	142,785
2012	49	11.31	1.03588	460,909	6,015	(8,223)	(184,645)	(125,970)	148,087	148,087
2013	50	12.31	1.03391	477,447	6,135	(8,516)	(191,270)	(130,490)	153,306	153,306
2014	51	13.31	1.03194	493,637	6,258	(8,803)	(197,756)	(134,915)	158,421	158,421
2015	52	14.31	1.03000	509,404	6,383	(9,083)	(204,072)	(139,224)	163,408	163,408
2016	53	15.31	1.03000	524,686	6,510	(9,354)	(210,194)	(143,400)	168,247	168,247
2017	54	16.31	1.03000	540,426	6,641	(9,634)	(216,500)	(147,702)	173,231	173,231
2018	55	17.31	1.03000	556,639	6,773	(9,922)	(222,995)	(152,133)	178,362	178,362
2019	56	18.31	1.03000	573,338	6,909	(10,218)	(229,685)	(156,697)	183,647	183,647
2020	57	19.31	1.03000	590,538	7,047	(10,523)	(236,575)	(161,398)	189,088	189,088
2021	58	20.31	1.03000	608,255	7,188	(10,838)	(243,673)	(166,240)	194,692	194,692
2022	59	21.31	1.03000	626,502	7,332	(11,162)	(250,983)	(171,228)	200,462	200,462
2023	60	22.31	1.03000	645,297	7,478	(11,495)	(258,512)	(176,364)	206,403	206,403
2024	61	22.56	1.03000	163,888	1,881	(2,919)	(65,655)	(44,792)	52,403	52,403
Total				\$10,528,440	\$138,049	(\$186,334)	(\$4,218,838)	(\$2,878,207)	\$3,383,110	\$3,315,667

Unempl.	Tax Rate	Pers. Cons.	Pension Contrib. Rate	401(k) Contrib. Rate
3.0%	41.300%	48.000%	0.000%	0.000%

EXHIBIT 3A. PRESENT VALUE OF LOST PENSION BENEFITS
MR. KEVIN CLEARY
SPECIAL MASTER WORKLIFE

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	PENSION CONTRIB.	NET PENSION (PROJECTED-VESTED)	TAXES	CONSUMPTION	NET LOSS	PV OF NET LOSS
2001	38	0.31	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
2002	39	1.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2003	40	2.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2004	41	3.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2005	42	4.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2006	43	5.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2007	44	6.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2008	45	7.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2009	46	8.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2010	47	9.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2011	48	10.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2012	49	11.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2013	50	12.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	51	13.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2015	52	14.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2016	53	15.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2017	54	16.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2018	55	17.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2019	56	18.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2020	57	19.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2021	58	20.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2022	59	21.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2023	60	22.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2024	61	23.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2025	62	24.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2026	63	25.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2027	64	26.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2028	65	27.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2029	66	28.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2030	67	29.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2031	68	30.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2032	69	31.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2033	70	32.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2034	71	33.31	0	0	0	0	0	0
2035	72	33.89	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total			\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0

EXHIBIT 4A. LOSS ESTIMATED VALUE OF REPLACEMENT SERVICES
MR. KEVIN CLEARY

YEAR	AGE	TIME FRAME	HOUSEHOLD SERVICES	CARE SERVICES	TOTAL SERVICES	PRESENT VALUE
2001	38	0.31			\$0	\$0
2002	39	1.31			0	0
2003	40	2.31			0	0
2004	41	3.31			0	0
2005	42	4.31			0	0
2006	43	5.31			0	0
2007	44	6.31			0	0
2008	45	7.31			0	0
2009	46	8.31			0	0
2010	47	9.31			0	0
2011	48	10.31			0	0
2012	49	11.31			0	0
2013	50	12.31			0	0
2014	51	13.31			0	0
2015	52	14.31			0	0
2016	53	15.31			0	0
2017	54	16.31			0	0
2018	55	17.31			0	0
2019	56	18.31			0	0
2020	57	19.31			0	0
2021	58	20.31			0	0
2022	59	21.31			0	0
2023	60	22.31			0	0
2024	61	23.31			0	0
2025	62	24.31			0	0
2026	63	25.31			0	0
2027	64	26.31			0	0
2028	65	27.31			0	0
2029	66	28.31			0	0
2030	67	29.31			0	0
2031	68	30.31			0	0
2032	69	31.31			0	0
2033	70	32.31			0	0
2034	71	33.31			0	0
2035	72	34.31			0	0
2036	73	35.06			0	0
Total			\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0